

1 **DECLARATION OF BETH CHRISMAN**

2 I, BETH CHRISMAN, hereby declare as follows:

3 1. I am an Expert Document Examiner and court qualified expert witness in the field of
4 questioned documents in the State of California. I am over the age of eighteen years, am of sound
5 mind, having never been convicted of a felony or crime of moral turpitude; I am competent in all
6 respects to make this Declaration. I have personal knowledge of the matters declared herein, and if
7 called to testify, I could and would competently testify thereto.

9 2. I have studied, was trained and hold a certification in the examination, comparison, analysis
10 and identification of handwriting, discrimination and identification of writing, altered numbers and
11 altered documents, handwriting analysis, trait analysis, including the discipline of examining
12 signatures. I have served as an expert within pending litigation matters and I have lectured and
13 taught handwriting related classes for two years within the United States. I am the Director of the
14 International School of Forensic Document Examination. A true and correct copy of my current
15 Curriculum Vitae ("C.V.") is attached as 'EXHIBIT A'. A true and correct copy of my list of court
16 testimonies is attached as 'EXHIBIT B'.

18 3. **Request:** I was asked to compare the handwriting on two (2) 'Notices to Vacate' and
19 one (1) 'Trespass Warning' note to the five (5) additional known handwriting of Paul Sulla, Jr. to
20 determine the author of the handwriting on the questioned documents.

21 4. **Questioned Documents:**

22 **EXHIBIT 4.1** An original 'Notice to Vacate' posted on September 20, 2013 addressed to
23 'Medical Veritas, Inc.' containing the alleged handwriting of Robert
24 Dukat.

25 **EXHIBIT 4.2** An original 'Notice to Vacate' posted on September 20, 2013 addressed
26 to 'Mr. Horowitz' containing the alleged handwriting of Robert Dukat.
27
28

1 **EXHIBIT 4.3** An original ‘Trespass Warning’ posted on September 20, 2013 addressed
2 to ‘current Occupants of 13-3775 Kalapana-Pahoa Highway, Pahoa,
3 Hawaii’ containing the alleged handwriting of Robert Dukat.

4 5. **Documents of ROBERT DUKAT:**

5 **EXHIBIT 5.1** A one page copy of an Application for Registration of Trade Name dated
6 April 16, 2013 containing the purported signature of Robert Dukat.

7 **EXHIBIT 5.2** A one page copy of a Declaration page of a ‘*Further Affiant Sayeth*
8 *Naught*’ dated November 3, 2013 containing the purported signature of
9 Robert Dukat.
10

11 6. **Documents of PAUL SULLA, JR.:**

12 **EXHIBIT 6.1 through EXHIBIT 6.45** Forty-five (45) documents consisting of
13 numerous envelopes and legal documents regarding Civil No.: 12-1-0417
14 containing the purported handwriting, numerals, and signatures of Paul
15 Sulla, Jr.
16

17 7. **Additional Documents of PAUL SULLA, JR.:**

18 **EXHIBIT 6.46 through EXHIBIT 6.51** Six (6) documents consisting of numerous
19 envelopes and legal documents regarding Civil No.: 12-1-0417
20 containing the purported handwriting, numerals, and signatures of Paul
21 Sulla, Jr.
22
23

24 8. **Basis of Opinion:** The basis for handwriting identification is that writing habits are not
25 instinctive or hereditary but are complex processes that are developed gradually through habit and
26 that handwriting is unique to each individual. Further, the basic axiom is that no one person writes
27 exactly the same way twice and no two people write exactly the same. Thus writing habits or
28

1 individual characteristics distinguish one person's handwriting from another. A process of analysis,
2 comparison and evaluation is conducted between the known standards and questioned document(s).
3 Based on the conclusions of the expert, an opinion will be expressed. The opinions are derived
4 from the ASTM Standard Terminology for Expressing Conclusions for Forensic Document
5 Examiners.

6 **9. Examinations & Observations:**

- 7 a. The documents provided are of good quality, with the many of the documents being
8 original.
- 9 b. The questioned documents were inter-compared to determine they were internally
10 consistent and all written by one writer.
- 11 c. The two known documents of Robert Dukat were compared with one another to determine
12 they are internally consistent and exhibit a signature that is angular with similar slant.
- 13 d. The questioned documents and known signature samples of Robert Dukat, Exhibit 5, were
14 then compared. The questioned signatures are actually signed 'R DUM' which is different
15 than the angular up and down movements seen in the known signature samples.
- 16 e. The known documents of Paul Sulla, Jr. contain numerous signatures however are limited
17 in hand printed alpha-numeric samples. The known samples were inter-compared with one
18 another to determine they are internally consistent and samples in Exhibit 6 were written by
19 one writer.
- 20 f. The questioned documents & known samples of Paul Sulla, Jr. were then compared to each
21 other revealing some similarity in letter formations, skill of writing, habits in the writing
22 and numeric formation. The similarity in the formation of the lower case 't', the upper case
23 'A' and the number '2' as well as the combined numbers '20' all fall within the normal
24 range of variation of the known writing of Paul Sulla, Jr. The stroke formation in letters
25
26
27
28

1 that contain cross-bars is similar between questioned and known samples; the pen stroke
2 will remain visible on paper as it goes from left to right to form the cross-bar in the letters
3 't', 'A', and 'H.'

4 g. If there were only two suspects or possible writers in this case; one being Robert Dukat and
5 the other being Paul Sulla, Jr., then it is more probable the author of the questioned
6 documents is Paul Sulla, Jr.

7
8 10. **Opinions:** Based upon my thorough analysis of these items, and from an application of
9 accepted forensic document examination tools, principles and techniques my professional expert
10 opinion follows:

11 a. There is a strong probability that the Robert Dukat of the known signature samples in
12 Exhibit 5 did not sign the three (3) questioned documents.

13 b. It is probable the Paul Sulla of the known handwriting and signature samples in Exhibit 6
14 wrote and signed the questioned documents; Exhibit 4.1, Exhibit 4.2 and Exhibit 4.3.

15 c. To reiterate; if there were only two suspects or possible writers in this case; one being
16 Robert Dukat and the other being Paul Sulla, Jr. then it is more probable the author of the
17 questioned documents is Paul Sulla, Jr.

18 Please see EXHIBIT C for levels of expressing opinions.

19
20 11. **Declaration:**

21 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the
22 foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on the 10th day of July,
23 2014, in Los Angeles, California.
24

25
26 
27 BETH CHRISMAN